

**REPUBLIC OF TURKEY**  
**ISTANBUL SABAHATTIN ZAIM UNIVERSITY**  
**INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**  
**DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING**

**THE ROLE OF ENGLISH SUBTITLES IN ENGLISH  
MOVIES ON EFL LEARNERS' CONTENT AND  
VOCABULARY COMPREHENSION**

**MA THESIS**

**Fadime AĐLAR**

**Istanbul**

**January, 2020**

**ISTANBUL SABAHATTIN ZAIM UNIVERSITY**  
**INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**  
**DEPARTMENT OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING**

**THE ROLE OF ENGLISH SUBTITLES IN ENGLISH MOVIES  
ON EFL LEARNERS' CONTENT AND VOCABULARY  
COMPREHENSION**

**MA THESIS**

**Fadime AĐLAR**

**Supervisor**

**Asst. Prof. Dr. Emrah GÖRGÜLÜ**

**Istanbul**

**January, 2020**

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Throughout the writing of this thesis I have got a great deal of support and assistance. Foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to my family for their endless love, affection, and support. They were always there for me with their precious hearts.

Also, I would like to give my special thanks to my supervisor Asst. Prof. Dr. Emrah Görgülü for his ideas, suggestions, encouragement and support.

I want to express my gratitude to my beloved one Kaan Sevim to support me greatly with his wonderful energy and to provide happy distraction with his love and understanding.

In addition, I would like to thank for my best friends Merve Çağlar, Ayşe Karataş, Betül Çelik and Nermin Kökbudak to feel their moral support with their great friendship as a source of my motivation.

I want to show my appreciation to Duygu Doğrucan for her great friendship and motivation that she gave me for long years and to Nadide Aybar for her affectionate heart and support.

Lastly, I would like to give my special thanks to Saime Kara Duman with her valuable guidance in especially statistical analysis for this study.

## ABSTRACT

### THE ROLE OF ENGLISH SUBTITLES IN ENGLISH MOVIES ON EFL LEARNERS' CONTENT AND VOCABULARY COMPREHENSION

Fadime AĐLAR

M.A., Department of English Language Teaching

Supervisor: Asst. Prof. Dr. Emrah GÖRGÜLÜ

January, 2020 – Page 56 + viii

This thesis aims to investigate the role of English subtitles on content comprehension of English movies and vocabulary comprehension. The participants were chosen from advanced level of students studying English language at the preparatory school of a foundation university. This research was carried out by using two documentary movies. The movies were chosen regarding the content and the language difficulty. There were two groups of students that were formed. One group watched the movies with subtitles and the other without subtitles. After watching the movies, the participants were asked to answer multiple choice questions related to content comprehension and vocabulary recognition. The data collected was analyzed with an independent samples *t*-test. The results revealed that the subtitles do not have a significant effect on comprehension of the videos that are watched. Also, the findings demonstrated that the non-subtitle group significantly outperformed the subtitle group on vocabulary comprehension. Hence, it can be said that subtitles are not considerably effective on content comprehension whereas it is significantly effective on vocabulary comprehension of movies.

Keywords: English movies, Subtitles, Content Comprehension, Vocabulary Comprehension

## ÖZET

# İNGİLİZCE FİMLERDEKİ ALTYAZILARIN YABANCI DİL ÖĞRENCİLERİNİN İÇERİK ANLAMA VE KELİME KAVRAMA ÜZERİNDEKİ ROLÜ

Fadime ÇAĞLAR

Yüksek Lisans, İngiliz Dili Eğitimi

Tez danışmanı: Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Emrah GÖRGÜLÜ

Ocak, 2020 – 56 sayfa + viii

Bu tez, İngilizce altyazıların filmlerin içeriğini anlama ve kelime tanıma üzerindeki rolünü incelemeyi amaçlamıştır. Katılımcılar, bir vakıf üniversitesinin hazırlık programında eğitim gören ileri seviye öğrenciler arasından seçilmiştir. Bu araştırma, deneysel olarak iki belgesel film kullanılarak incelenmiştir. Filmler, içerik ve dil zorluğu göz önünde bulundurularak seçilmiştir. Çalışmada oluşturulan iki grup vardır. Filmleri, bir grup altyazılı, diğer grup ise altyazısız izlemiştir. Filmleri izledikten sonra, katılımcıların içerik anlama ve kelime kavrama ile ilgili çoktan seçmeli soruları cevaplamaları istendi. Toplanan veriler, bağımsız bir örneklem t testi ile analiz edildi. Sonuçlar, altyazının bir belgeselin anlaşılmasında önemli bir etkisi olmadığını ortaya koydu. Ayrıca, bulgular altyazılı olmayan grubun kelime tanımada altyazılı gruptan önemli ölçüde daha iyi performans sergilediğini göstermiştir. Bu nedenle, altyazının içerik kavramada önemli ölçüde etkili olmadığı ama kelime tanımada önemli bir etkisi olduğu söylenebilir.

Anahtar kelimeler: İngilizce filmler, Altyazı, İçerik kavrama, Kelime kavrama

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>THESIS APPROVAL .....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>DECLARATION OF SCIENTIFIC ETHICS AND ORIGINALITY .....</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>ABSTRACT .....</b>	<b>iv</b>
<b>ÖZET.....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>CHAPTER I.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Introduction .....	1
1.2. Background of the Study.....	1
1.3 The Purpose of the Study.....	4
1.4. The Research Questions.....	4
1.5. Significance of the Problem .....	4
1.6 Limitations of the Study.....	5
1.7 The Structure of the Study.....	7
<b>CHAPTER II .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>LITERATURE REVIEW.....</b>	<b>7</b>
2.1 Introduction .....	7
2.2 The Use of Subtitles in Language Learning .....	11
2.3 The Effects of Subtitles on Vocabulary Comprehension.....	14
2.4 Effect of Subtitles on Content Comprehension .....	19
2.5 Selection of Movies For Classroom Use.....	21
2.6. Conclusion.....	24
<b>CHAPTER III .....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>METHODOLOGY.....</b>	<b>26</b>
3.1 Introduction .....	26
3.2 Research Design .....	26
3.3. Treatment Instruments and Procedures.....	27
3.4. Settings and Participants .....	28
3.4.1 Experimental Group.....	29

3.4.2 Control Group .....	30
3.5 Data Collection Instrument.....	30
3.6 Data Analysis Procedure .....	31
3.7 Conclusion.....	32
<b>CHAPTER IV .....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>FINDINGS &amp; RESULTS.....</b>	<b>33</b>
4.1. Introduction .....	33
4.1. Results.....	33
4.1.1 Movie Comprehension.....	33
4.1.2 Vocabulary Comprehension.....	34
4.3. Conclusion.....	35
<b>CHAPTER V .....</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>36</b>
5.1. Introduction .....	36
5.2. Discussion of the Findings.....	36
5.3. Suggestions for the Further Studies.....	42
5.4 Conclusion.....	43
<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>46</b>
<b>APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>49</b>
APPENDICES A: The movie test I.....	49
APPENDICES B: The movie test II .....	53

## LIST OF TABLES

<b>Table 4.1: Movie Comprehension 1</b> .....	34
<b>Table 4.2: Vocabulary Comprehension 1</b> .....	34



# **CHAPTER I**

## **INTRODUCTION**

### **1.1 Introduction**

The study explores the effects of English subtitles on vocabulary comprehension and content comprehension of English movies. It is an attempt to find out whether there is any significant difference between subtitled and non-subtitled movies on content comprehension and vocabulary comprehension. This chapter includes the background of the study, the reasons for choosing the topic, the statement of the problems, the objectives and significance of the study, the limitations of the study and research hypotheses.

### **1.2. Background of the Study**

With the developments of applying different teaching techniques in language learning, audio-visual media tools, computers and movies have gained more importance and had more considerable impacts to teach English efficiently and comprehensively (Canning-Wilson, 2000; Kikuchi, 1997; Kothari, Pandey & Chudgar, 2004; Lewis & Anping, 2002; Meskill, 1996; Ryan, 1998; Weyer, 1999). Notably, the fact that learners are visually informed might be central in language learning now that it presents gestures, facial expressions and body language associated with the context, intonation, accent of the words besides the authentic usage of the language and culture. Hence, the use of movies play an important role in teaching English as a foreign language in classrooms. It is obvious that English movies are watched in most countries all around the world and are a common part of life in order to provide entertainment in English language classes. Many people might benefit from English movies so that they can learn the language. Specifically, it is quite beneficial to assist students to learn English with the help of using movies to teach a foreign language. There is a positive impact of English movies in learning language with the reasons that they enhance the motivation of the students and help them decrease their anxiety level. In other words, the learners might get high anxiety due to the reason of not knowing the language well. At this point, the movies are significantly useful in reducing their

anxiety. Nevertheless, they are not considered as only the way of entertainment. They are considered as a crucial tool of language teaching. The use of movies could make a great contribution to students' language learning process. The fact that the movies are used in foreign language classes as a teaching tool is not a recent idea. The use of movies has many considerable benefits such as introducing the variety and reality into the classroom. Moreover, movies enable the students to apply their background, knowledge and experiences during discussions related to the movies. Teachers could make classes more engaging as long as the students bring their background and experiences into the classrooms. Most people consider that viewing movies gives pleasure to people and appreciate having a conversation about them. When it is considered from a motivational perspective, it is clear that they are a great option to provide motivation in language learning classrooms. On the other hand, teachers have some critical responsibilities to find appropriate movies with the aim of making them educationally valuable. The students are exposed to rich aural input with the usage of movies. Also, they are provided visual input by integrating subtitles into the movies. It is the following type of input that this current study will touch upon. According to Kusumarasyati (2005), it is stated that learners have the exposure to the movies without subtitles in language learning classes and are asked to watch them and at the same time to understand the dialogues in the target language. Nonetheless, it is probable to watch movies with subtitles in the target language. The advances in technology provide a number of options about how to watch movies. Apart from adopting the sound and images, integrating the subtitles into the movies is a great tool to give an assistance to the comprehension and language learning. As for the contribution that subtitles make in language learning, it might be said that they are amazing tools owing to providing the entertainment about different cultures and countries and suggesting a different way to learn a foreign language. The National Center for Technology Innovative and Center for Implementing Technology in Education (2010) claims that people learning English could find many useful opportunities with the assistance of subtitles. Based on previous studies, it is shown that using the subtitles has more positive impacts than non-subtitled movies in terms of developing listening comprehension. The learners having the exposure of subtitled movies in foreign language learning have outperformed in reading and listening comprehension. Also, it is revealed that subtitles help the learners achieve better in word recognition, vocabulary acquisition, motivation and decoding abilities. In

addition, it is essential to differentiate the reading of subtitles from the usual reading of printed words on a page. It seems that viewing subtitles is more likely to be connected to listening rather than reading. The reason is that learners have only one chance to see subtitles and then subtitles disappear quickly. The watcher cannot find any other chance to read the text one more time while watching it. At that time, besides reliance of their skills in comprehension the context, they must achieve it very fast. National Center for Technology Innovation & Center for Implementing Technology in Education (2010) asserts that the integration of subtitles into movies brings many advantageous results to language learning classes since a usual class that is based on watching movies is linked with only a picture viewing activity. However, in a class where they are asked to watch a subtitled movie, they are guided to cope with additional reading practice. Based on the acclamation of The National Center for Technology Innovative and Center for Implementing Technology in Education (2010), the study concludes that viewing movies seems to offer a great influence on comprehension skills and associating the view with the text. Particularly, vocabulary acquisition of learners might be improved with the use of subtitles. Although many learners perform well in subtitled movies, it might be a bit challenging for very young children to catch the speed of subtitles and to tackle the reading. Especially regarding the learners with low-level reading skills, it is critical for teachers to make a movie choice that students have less difficulty in comprehending the subtitles. Furthermore, with regard to the assertion of Krashen (1982), it is a necessity for language learners to get sufficient input of the language with the purpose of accomplishing the target of learning a foreign language. Hence, movies have been used by English language teachers for many years but without the integration of subtitles at different levels from different ages (Baltova, 1999; Borrás & Lafayette, 1994; Garza, 1991; Neuman & Koskinen, 1992; Vanderplank, 1988). As for the main question, it is possible to show movies with or without subtitles. This significant topic has a big gap in integrating movies with subtitles into the classrooms regarding comprehension and vocabulary studies carried out with Turkish participants and EFL. In order to touch upon this gap and contribute to the field, it is intended to investigate the role and impact of movies with or without subtitles in context comprehension and vocabulary comprehension. Therefore, with the purpose of finding out the answer of this question on comprehension and vocabulary comprehension, in this current study, the two techniques are going to be applied as bimodal subtitling technique that means English

subtitles with English dialogues and no-subtitling technique in which English dialogues are presented without subtitles.

### **1.3 The Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of the present study is to examine the influence of subtitles on content comprehension and vocabulary comprehension of English movies for EFL students at the preparatory school of a foundation university in Istanbul. It is aimed to reveal possible impacts of English subtitles in English movies regarding the comprehension of movies and vocabulary recognition. Particularly, the objective of this current study is to find out whether there is any significant difference between the subtitle group and non-subtitle group on the factors mentioned above. In light of the background, it seeks to find the answers to the following research questions.

### **1.4. The Research Questions**

In this section, the main research questions are indicated that are at the center of current study. These questions are:

1. Is there any significant difference between the group watching the subtitled documentaries and the group watching them without subtitles in terms of content comprehension?
2. Is there any significant difference between the group treated with movie subtitles and the group treated without any subtitles in terms of vocabulary comprehension?

### **1.5. Significance of the Problem**

According to the statement of King (2002), it could be said that films include many pedagogical opportunities and language learners' motivation might increase through the integration of films. As long as films are integrated into the language classes, learners take an advantage of the movies with the chance of learning different words, phrases and idioms heard in the films, which is a significant way of developing their target language. There is variety of films including comic, horror, romantic, science-fiction and documentary movies. Regarding the preferences of the learners about the types of movies, teachers can attract the attention of learners and make them more enthusiastic towards language learning since watching movies is considered as one of their favorable activities. With the regard to the learners who do not show any

enthusiasm in foreign language learning, the integration of different types of movies could be beneficial for inspiring language learners in the direction of their individual interests. Accordingly, it could be stated that the usage of movies in language classes have some benefits due to triggering individuals' interests for the types of movies. The learning process is closely associated with the way they watch movies. Specifically, one way is to watch movies with the help of subtitles whereas the other is watching them without subtitles.

Furthermore, the presence of subtitles in watching movies assists learners to not only give a boost to the comprehension of expressions related to daily usage of English language but also to gain new vocabulary items and idioms. Apart from the comprehension of the context, the usage of subtitles stimulate learners to study English outside the classroom for the reason of entertaining nature of the movies. In this way, they are able to find an opportunity of having a familiarity with original dialogues by watching subtitled movies. As a consequence of the integration of subtitles, it enables language learners to comprehend what is going on in the movie effortlessly. To put it another way, it is more probable for learners to get the comprehension of the events in the movie without difficulty with the usage of subtitles. Many studies were conducted with the aim of making a comparison between the presence and absence of subtitles. According to one of the studies done by Grgurovi, M. & Hegelheimer (2007), it could be concluded that the learners were more involved in comprehension of the movie with the help of subtitles in the listening class. Considering the previous work, few researchers have addressed to focus on the influence of presence and absence of subtitles on movie comprehension and vocabulary comprehension in Turkey. In other words, this particular area of English language learning still has not been dealt with in depth in Turkey. In the light of recent studies, there is still some considerable concern about the effectiveness of subtitles on movie and vocabulary comprehension. With these criteria in mind, the aim of this thesis is to broaden current knowledge of the impact of subtitles on content comprehension of movies and vocabulary recognition. Thus, there might be notable implications for both teachers and students in English learning classes in this study.

### **1.6 Limitations of the Study**

There are a number of limitations of this present study concerned about the the number of participants, the number of movies integrated into the classes, the language

competence of the participants, the type of movie, the prejudice of students against the subtitles, the lack of concentration. These mentioned limitations are going to be indicated specifically below. It suffers from the limitation associated with the fact that this current study is an experimental study including one experimental group and one control group. It involves 65 participants as the subtitled group (experimental group) with 32 students and the non-subtitled group (control group) with 33 students. That is to say, it may not be sufficient to conduct a study with only 65 students. In order to have reliable and valid results in that sense, it is hard to generalize the results of the current study to a large group of EFL learners. More participants could have been involved in this research and the findings might have been different. Also, the participants were picked from the students studying in preparatory school at a foundation university in İstanbul. In other words, the findings cannot be generalized to all the EFL learners of İstanbul and Turkey because of the case that the study is based on inadequate data.

One concern about the findings of the study is the number of movies used in this study. The study is conducted by integrating only two movies. The reason why the study is based on only two movies is that the teachers need to follow the curriculum of the preparatory school as a necessity. To put it another way, they are not allowed to benefit from some extracurricular activities such as movies and games. Consequently, this research was conducted by taking into consideration the system and curriculum of the school.

When it comes to the last limitation of the study, it is connected with the level of the participants. They were considered as competent language learners and chosen among advanced level students. In order to carry out this study, these advanced level of learners were deliberately chosen regarding their ability in language and the language difficulty of the movies. It was a critical point that their language competent was matching with the language difficulty of the movies to gather reliable data. Moreover, the students participating in this study were the ones that started in A2 level at the beginning of the year, which means they already had some language background and experience. Nonetheless, the study includes some students with low-level of language skills although they actually seem to be in advanced level. Thus, this case results in the fact that it was troublesome for some students to get the understanding of the language of the movies during the research.

## **1.7 The Structure of the Study**

The second chapter will present a review of literature by providing previous research carried out in Turkey and the world with aim of informing about the findings and the gap of the field in this sense. Also, the third chapter is related to methodology, data analysis. The results of the study will be revealed to make conclusions. The fourth chapter will discuss the findings of the research and then some suggestions will be stated with the purpose of making a contribution to further studies. Lastly, the conclusion part will be presented.



## **CHAPTER II**

### **LITERATURE REVIEW**

#### **2.1 Introduction**

The process of language learning and teaching requires social human activities similar to linguistic entities. That is, communication plays a significant role in language teaching in order to facilitate the authentic interaction. It is strongly evident that authentic comprehensible input can be provided through multimedia tools having many practical effects on language learning (Brett, 1995; Khalid, 2001). Some multimedia tools including tv, computer, networks, video cassette recorders, might be used to integrate real-life situations in the target language into the the language classrooms so as to increase the effectiveness of teaching procedure. It is stated that most teachers take advantage of visual materials efficiently at all levels of foreign language classes (Markham, 1999). According to Çakır (Cakir, 2006), there has been an increasing focus on teaching languages from communicative aspects with the help of visual and audial materials. Despite the increasing focus and access to technological tools, it can be seen that language learners go through some challenges in comprehending TV programs in the target language. Hence, the comprehension of language learners are enhanced by providing mother tongue of target language subtitles. Movies, TV series and TV programs are integrated into the language classrooms and many educators and researchers use subtitles to make comprehension of learners better due to the effect of TV shows and programs including a rich context to acquire a foreign language. Based on the dual-coding theory Paivio (1971), it is suggested that the number of signals related to the message given increases as long as meanings are provided with pictures. Therefore, it is more probable that learners will comprehend the message at a higher level and recall it in an easy way.

It is of importance to provide some background information about the usage of movie subtitles and captions in foreign language teaching and learning since the purpose of the current study is to investigate the effects of viewing subtitled movies with regard to the improvement of vocabulary learning. The starting point of the story about

introducing the subtitles and captions into movies was the time when closed subtitled TV programs were transmitted by the National Subtitling Institute in the U.S. so as to make movies available for the hearing impaired in 1980. Some studies were conducted by language teachers and researchers in a way that accomplished the desired results with the aim of figuring out the impacts of subtitled movies for the hearing impaired students in EFL classes. The effort of teachers and researchers was to examine whether utilizing the subtitled movies could result in enhancement in language learning. It was found that incorporating subtitles into movies gave an assistance to foreign language comprehension and acquisition (e.g. Price, 1983; Garza, 1991). Moreover, movies promoted the enthusiasm and interest of the learners in watching movies with the help of subtitles and captions. In other words, learners supported the belief that using the subtitles could be more encouraging in learning a foreign language. Taking into account all of these, the first study was carried out by Price (1983). This study was a preliminary experiment that attempted to make an association between viewing TV programs with subtitles and foreign language learning. Before the actual study, a pilot project was done in order to address the contribution of subtitles in TV programs that students received an advantage while foreign students of ESL were studying. There were four-hundred and fifty participants. In the light of reported results, he came to the conclusion that the correlation between watching subtitled TV programs and language comprehension was confirmed and it was a beneficial way to make a contribution to the achievement of foreign language learners. That is to say, the fact that the learners are exposed to the linguistic information included in the video is in line with the development of language comprehension.

As the authors noted earlier, more studies are necessary to look into the use of subtitles in English movies and TV series. A study was carried out with the aim of revealing whether there is a beneficial impact of using subtitles in BBC television programs by Vanderplank (1988). Participants in the data collection were fifteen university students of L2 English at a

high-intermediate and advanced level. They were exposed to watch BBC television programs with English subtitles. The process included nine hour-long sessions. The observations of the the participants demonstrated that they were good at following the text, sound and picture at the same time. It was obvious that they did not have any difficulty in performing these three tasks simultaneously. As a further matter,

according to the performance of the participants on language-oriented activities, it is stated that the use of subtitles enable the students to enhance their understanding. Additionally, the use of subtitles did not raise any difficulty for students to focus on the movie and text at the same time. With the help of the subtitles, they could perceive the intended context of the program in spite of fast, authentic speech and strange accents. To put it another way, the participants were quite satisfied with the fact that they had the skill to keep an eye on the spoken language despite the existence of the text. It can be concluded that the use of subtitles is not an obstacle to learners. It is worth stating the significant findings revealed by the results of the research with regard to the point that subtitles gave an assistance to the participants to recall the language used in the programs in a higher level. Overall, it is fundamental to note that the use of subtitles is a good choice for the students to improve their foreign language learning skills rather than being an impediment.

In the same fashion, Gielen (1988) underlined the importance of the subtitles by conducting a research. The study provides a considerable insight into the correlation between subtitled videos and achievement in foreign language learning. The findings have strengthened conviction that the retention of the language used in text of the subtitles can be reinforced. The study included Dutch students of German who were asked to complete a surprise memory test after they viewed a video segment from a well-known German show. The participants were separated into two groups. One group was given the subtitled video whereas another viewed it without any subtitles. When both groups were compared, it was found out that the group watching the subtitled video outperformed substantially the group viewing it without any subtitles. It is worthwhile noting that subtitles have advantages over recalling the language used in the video in accordance with the findings obtained from the collected data. This study would appear to indicate that subtitled videos make a contribution to the recall of vocabulary items in the video.

Koskinen, Kane, Jensema, Markham and Knable (1995) conducted a research with the purpose of evaluating whether the subtitled programs have any impacts on the incidental vocabulary acquisition. To find out the correlation between subtitles and incidental vocabulary acquisition, 72 participants were selected as volunteers to make a contribution to the research. They were placed in two separate groups including the task of watching the program with and without subtitles. During the process, they

were assigned to view nine science information segments for nine weeks. After viewing the segments, three post-tests were given to the participants. The aim of the post-tests is to assess whether the subjects could recognize the targeted words and sentences. Additionally, in an attempt to investigate the perception of the participants about using the subtitled programs, a questionnaire was utilized after they viewed TV. Taken as a whole, the results obtained from the analysis of data highlighted no significant differences with regard to the word recognition and sentence anomaly post-tests between two groups. However, based on the findings, it was demonstrated that both groups could differ in the word-meaning test. In other words, the group exposed to watching the subtitled program achieved better than the group viewing it without subtitles in the word meaning test. Besides, the remarkable result to emerge from the data of the questionnaire emphasized the validity of positive impact of subtitles on students motivation as the analysis indicated that the perception of the subjects were quite positive towards the usage of subtitled programs and the science videos.

In a similar way, Markham (1989) carried out a research in order to provide considerable insight into the impacts of subtitled TV program and its contribution to the comprehension of ESL university students. The participants consisted of 76 university level ESL students. According to the data gathered, it is fundamental to note that subtitled TV programs made a substantial contribution to the comprehension of beginner, intermediate and advanced ESL university students. Consequently, the research provided further evidence that the usage of subtitles and comprehension are positively correlated with each other.

Garza conducted an experiment that tried to find out the effects of subtitled TV program on language comprehension. The results confirmed the evidence that language comprehension could be enhanced with the help of the utility of subtitles. To put it another way, the findings implicate a significant role of subtitles in an effort of improving the language comprehension. Moreover, the research done by Goldman (1996) investigated whether subtitled program could be utilized as a dynamic supplemental teaching assistance. The findings led us to conclude that teaching reading comprehension can be enhanced in intermediate and advanced ESL programs. The evidence from this study points towards the idea that the usage of subtitled TV program is a noteworthy point in promoting the enthusiasm of the language learners. The experimental investigations give rise to the utility of subtitles for the aim of making

the teaching process easier if the teaching can be embellished with the help of different activities such as previewing the vocabulary, building context, guessing and discussion.

## **2.2 The Use of Subtitles in Language Learning**

The existence of subtitles in foreign films has existed for a long time in most countries since films were not dubbed into the official target language. When the subtitles have been utilized as a teaching aid in foreign language education, there is a belief that they have been sometimes a distractor and show a tendency to reduce the speed of the improvement of listening skills in the view of the fact that learners are dependent on the text instead of the stream of speech. On the other hand, many studies have showed evidence that subtitles have a fundamental contribution in promoting the learning acquisition process since they play a fundamental role in making available the authentic and comprehensible language input for learners. In other words, based on many studies, subtitles do not pose any obstacles about the concentration and they are far from being a source of laziness. They provide assistance to the language learning potentially (Vanderplank, 1988: 272-273).

There is always a preconceived idea with regard to movie subtitles for the reason that their nature is quite bothering. This bias has gained popularity especially in Spain where this bias has become so widespread traditionally. The subtitles are regarded as a source of annoyance by many viewers on the condition that regular tv and cinema subtitles do not make it available to be chosen all the time. Apart from these prejudices mentioned above, many viewers have given thought that the subtitles of movies minimize the reliability of the show since they are seen on the screen of the show. Additionally, many people have the belief that they cannot get enough understanding of the audiovisual input due to the fact that they give attention to reading the subtitles rather than focusing on just hearing what are said in the movie.

Another widespread view concerning the use of subtitles in foreign language education is a long-established view that the use of subtitles interferes with their concentration and is an actual cause of laziness. Furthermore, the use of subtitles is perceived as a way of dependence for viewers. In other words, as they continue to watch a movie with the help of subtitles, they get in the habit of viewing it with subtitles. As a result

of this habit, it may have a negative impact such as easing the listening comprehension skills on learners.

Despite all the beliefs and prejudices, the use of subtitles is far from being an obstacle in concentration and distraction. To put it another way, the subtitles make a contribution to language learning (Vanderplank, 1988: 277). According to many learners, subtitles assist them to follow the speech in the movie rather than being a distraction. Otherwise, the control over the speech disappears easily. As a matter of fact, when viewers are exposed to the TV programs or movies that do not include any subtitles, it is probable for them to get nervous and feel insecure. Many studies have demonstrated that when the subtitles are incorporated into the movies, immediate feedback is made available. As a consequence of that, learners might be reinforced positively, which gives assistance to reveal the feeling of being secure on learners. In long-term effects, it provides a way that they may be independent on watching foreign language television or films with subtitles without any support (Vanderplank, 1988).

Thus, the majority of prior research has emphasized that most learners regard the incorporation of subtitles as a source of encouragement to comprehend the context of movie and acquire new vocabulary items notwithstanding that there are some other learners supporting the opinion that they are easily distracted from the stream of speech by the subtitles. Accordingly, if subtitles are used for the educational purposes such as learning a foreign language, they might be practical. Also, it is of importance that they are necessary to be used for an aim. Learners are required to take an advantage of subtitles according to a specific purpose instead of a purpose to get understanding of everything which is told in the movie.

It is essential to keep in mind that there are some significant impacts stating that memory is visually connected with the mnemonic power of imagery with regard to the practical usage of video input and subtitles to learn the second language (Danan, 1992). Incorporating subtitles in a video gives a chance to make associations among image, sound in one language and text. When they are linked to each other, it becomes an effective stimulation to recall language use for learners. Provided that we think of the additional impacts, it could be stated that it is an inevitable part for foreign language learning to benefit from both visual images and translation themselves. Canning- Wilson (2000) asserts the expression when she makes a suggestion 'images contextualized in video or on its own can help to reinforce language learning, provided

the learner can see immediate meaning in terms of vocabulary recognition'. It is one of the most influential ways to learn the meanings with the support of subtitles.

There have been a large number of various studies conducted by researchers in order to examine the different aspects of the impact of subtitled movies on second/ foreign language learning. The study of Zanon (2006) focuses on the benefit of computer-based subtitling on second/foreign language learning. Based on the findings obtained, it was stated that learners' motivation could be increased because of the fact that they could have an opportunity to comprehend the content of the movie. Expressed in a different way, the study provided evidence that learners can be stimulated to grasp the context of the movie as well as to enhance their motivation.

Furthermore, Kusumarasdyati (2005) conducted a study which aims to investigate whether or not viewing the subtitled movies makes a contribution to improving the listening skills of EFL learners. According to the findings, it was seen that subtitled movies had a significant contribution to their listening skills. The results support the belief that watching movies with subtitles are better options than the ones without subtitles in the development of listening skills.

In the research of Borrás & Lafayette (1994), they aim to evaluate the influence of subtitled videos on language comprehension and production. In line with this purpose of the study, they used short video segments with subtitles in an interactive multimedia course. During the process, the learners watched a video segment including subtitles and without subtitles. From the results, it is clear that both comprehension and production of the language are closely interrelated since providing the participants to control the subtitles by incorporating the subtitled video segments enables them to achieve better in comprehension and production.

Grgurovic & Hegelheimer (2007) carried out a research to make a comparison between transcripts and subtitles in comprehension of learners in the second/ foreign language learning. Regarding the objective of the study, the researchers utilized a multimedia listening activity. The participants were given both the subtitles and transcript of an academic lecture. The findings indicated that the participants were more inclined to make a choice on subtitles than the transcript. The reason why subtitles were more preferable than the transcript lies in the fact that the subtitles were more beneficial to have a comprehension the lecture according the belief of the participants.

Grignon, Lavaur, & Blanc (2005) did a research with regard to the influence of subtitles on movie comprehension by integrating there different versions of subtitles. The participants in the study were asked to watch a movie with three versions including dubbed, subtitled and original versions. The results obtained from the data highlight the significance of dubbed and subtitled movies rather than original versions in movie comprehension.

### **2.3 The Effects of Subtitles on Vocabulary Comprehension**

There have been numerous studies to investigate the benefits and uses of subtitles and subtitles on audiovisual materials recognizing the necessity of subtitles. A great number of authors in literature stating that it is essential to make some significant laws mandating its availability has discussed this issue. A large number of existing studies in the broader literature have examined how beneficial it is to integrate the audiovisual materials such as videos, movies, documentaries and TV series in order to enhance general L2 reading and listening comprehension. There are key questions and notions that are still not discussed in the literature about what contribution can be made to comprehension of vocabulary beyond just reading and listening. Therefore, an important issue in the literature is to investigate the impacts of subtitled videos on the learning of second language words and phrases. Neumann and Koskinen (1992) made a systematic investigation into the acquisition of vocabulary with the subtitled audiovisual materials to reach conclusions. There were four different conditions including subtitled video clips, video clips without subtitles, reading and listening to the soundtrack, and the reading only. The experiment provided a considerable insight into the benefits of the subtitled videos. In other words, it is reported that the better performance could be observed in the group viewing the video with subtitles with regard to vocabulary acquisition. As a further matter, Holobowet et al. (1984), were interested whether incorporating the subtitled videos into the foreign language class makes contribution to recalling of the vocabulary items heard by learners. The starting point of the experiment is to make a comparison between the subtitled videos and the ones without subtitles. Taken together, the findings gained the insight that there was a positive correlation between viewing the subtitled videos and recalling vocabulary. To put it another way, it can be stated that the investigation stresses the significance of listening to and reading the text simultaneously in videos for the reason that it gives assistance to students to differentiate familiar vocabularies from unfamiliar ones. In

the study carried out by Koostra, Jonannes and Beentjes (1999), they aim to evaluate the efficacy of subtitled condition concerning the point of vocabulary recognition. In the experiment, 246 Dutch learners of ESL were picked. They were assigned to view a 15-minute documentary. Afterwards, in order to gather the data, the investigation was based on a vocabulary recognition test. The results lead to a similar conclusion found because of the previous studies. That is to say, the subtitled group has a substantially higher level of scores across the group without subtitles in vocabulary recognition.

In an article by Chai, Judy and Erlam, Rosemary (2008) they draw our attention to the gap in the field by exploring the effects of video clips on the learning of second language words and phrases. In the study, twenty Chinese participants were divided into two groups as one control and experimental group. The experimental group watched a short video sequence with subtitles and the control group watched it without subtitles. During the process, pre-test and post-test were used as well as an interview that participants were required to complete. The results highlighted that there is a positive interrelation between the usage of subtitles, and learning of unknown words and phrases. This result is significant to reveal that micro-level of learning can be enhanced through the subtitled videos. When it comes to the results of the interview, it is demonstrated that the responses of the participants were positive towards the use of subtitled video in language learning contexts. When the subjects were asked about the usage of subtitles, the majority of the participants in the experimental group commented that they paid attention to the reading of subtitles in watching the video. Moreover, some participants stated that they could not give importance to both sound and pictures at the same time.

The purpose of the study carried out by Aisyarani (2014) is to find out the correlation between vocabulary and using movies in classrooms. In other words, the researcher tried to analyze whether or not it is significant to use

Based on the purpose of analyzing whether there is an influence on watching cartoons with subtitles for learning vocabulary incidentally. Karakas (2012) conducted a research. 42 first grade English Language teaching (ELT) department students participated in the study at the University of Mehmet Akif Ersoy, Burdur in Turkey. To gather data from the participants, a 5-point vocabulary knowledge scale was employed and 18 target words were incorporated into the scale. Moreover, the

experiment was carried out with the pre-test and post-test group design. The participants were separated into two groups randomly as one subtitle group and the other no-subtitle group. Both groups took the same pre- and post-test. Because of the analysis of the data collected, it is highlighted that both groups scored at the same level according to t-test results, which means they do not differ in improvement. Taken as a whole, these results are not broadly in line with the assumption that the subtitled groups are better than non-subtitled group in a matter of gaining vocabulary.

Sydorenko (2010) investigated how influential the input modality is with regard to learning written and aural vocabulary forms. Also, the research was based on the examination of vocabulary acquisition and concentration to input and what strategies are benefited by learners to learn vocabulary. For the study, twenty-six second-semester learners of Russian in Michigan State University were chosen as participants. This proceeded in two groups of students. Group One including 8 participants were given with audio and subtitles or video audio. Group Two consisting of 9 participants viewed video with audio or video audio. Group Three having 9 participants watched video with subtitles or video subtitles. With the purpose of finding out the differences among groups, the researcher employ survey data collected from written and aural vocabulary tests and a final questionnaire as different data collection methods. As for the findings of the study, the analysis reveals that the groups viewing video with subtitles, and video with subtitles and audio delivered a better performance on written rather than on recognition of the word forms aurally. Meanwhile, when the groups were compared, the results indicate that the VAC group achieved one step ahead the VA group concerning learning more word meaning. There is another finding of understanding the attention of the learners to subtitles. This study found evidence from the questionnaire that learners took notice of subtitles followed by video and audio. Additionally, they gained most vocabulary items for the reason that they could have a chance to associate the words with images visually. Over and above that, it is pointed out that viewing video with subtitles provides an assistance to learners in order to recognize the written word forms and gain an understanding of word meaning. In the meantime, it is found that video without subtitles has a tendency to enhance listening comprehension since the recognition of aural word forms is facilitated.

As a further matter, in a study which examined the impacts of subtitling task on vocabulary learning and its effective uses, Lertola (2012) carried out a quasi-

experimental study at the National University of Ireland to examine the usage of subtitled movies in foreign language classes. The data were analyzed and correlated with uses both qualitative and quantitative methods to focus on the influences of the subtitling task in the process of incidental vocabulary acquisition. As participants, the sixteen students of Italian as a foreign language were asked to complete to either subtitling practice (Experimental Group) or oral comprehension tasks and writing tasks (Control Group). The researcher worked with both groups for a total of four hours (1 hour per week). A pre-test was employed to make sure that the participants were not familiar with the target words. Additionally, immediate and delayed post-tests were used after the experiment. The results casts a light on that both groups exposed to watch the movie with subtitles and without subtitles made a progress in incidental vocabulary acquisition acquisition from pre-test to immediate and delayed post-tests. It is stated that it is not feasible to make certain conclusions owing to the participants restricted in number. However, this study is consistent with the findings of the recent studies in terms of the effect of the subtitling practice as an influential effective pedagogical tool in the EFL class. It is mostly essential to do further research to highlight what the impacts of subtitled movies there are on vocabulary learning.

Koolstra and Beentjes (1999) conducted a research to get information about whether it is practical to learn English vocabulary by watching a television program with English soundtrack and Dutch subtitles. According to the findings, it was revealed that the participants could have the highest score in the subtitled version. The study included Two hundred and forty-six Dutch children. Those participants were assigned to watch a 15 minute documentary. They were asked to watch it with three experimental conditions. Specifically, they watched an English program with Dutch subtitles. Secondly, they were asked to watch the same English program without subtitles. As a third condition, they viewed a language program in Dutch. When it comes to the choice of participants, it was stated that the students of grade 4 were chosen, as they did not have any familiarity with formal English classes, whereas the participants in grade 6 would have some information about formal English regularly. The findings indicate that the group watching the subtitled documentaries got higher scores in vocabulary than the group watching it without subtitles. In other words, the results of the experiment found clear support for the usage of subtitled video clips rather than the one without subtitles. Specifically, the participants in Grade 6 had a

better performance than the ones in Grade 4. Further analysis showed that the participants could recognize more words after they were assigned to watch the subtitled documentary than the non-subtitled version. There is a positive correlation between the frequency of watching programs with subtitles at home and vocabulary comprehension. This is important to correctly interpret the results confirming that more elements of a foreign language can be acquired with the help of subtitled television programs. Over and above that, it is reported that the participants in the group exposed to the documentary without Dutch subtitles could acquire English vocabulary items. To put it another way, the results confirm the belief that the subtitle is not an obstacle to hear the words for the participants.

Stewart and Pertusa (2004) carried out a research in an effort to enhance the comprehension of films in the target language. The purpose of the study is to find out whether there is a difference between watching films with English subtitles and Spanish subtitles. This study is noteworthy revealing which of the subtitling modes make more contribution to the vocabulary recognition of students. As for the level of students' level, it is said that intermediate level of students participated in the study. After the analysis of the data collected, it is observed that intralingual subtitles have more impacts in terms of facilitating the skill to recognize the vocabulary items. That is to say, the findings of the study emphasized the importance of integrating subtitled films into the process of vocabulary recognition.

Markham, (1999) tried to explore the questions of whether the subtitled videos provide support to students so that they might recognize the word by viewing them. For this purpose, multiple-choice tests were administered by means of speech. Regarding the aim of finding out the efficiency of subtitles, two short videos that run 12 and 13 minutes respectively were presented to 118 advanced ESL students. The first group had the task of watching subtitled videos whereas the second group watched them without any subtitles. In the upcoming listening tests, the statements instantaneously from the script were presented to the participants verbally. Based on the findings obtained from these tests, it is important that the access of subtitles in video enhances the skill of identifying the words heard and presented. Specifically, this research highlights the superior impact of the subtitled videos over the videos in the absence of subtitles with reference to vocabulary recognition. This result has further strengthened

our confidence in the favorable usage of subtitles rather than no subtitles with the purpose of providing a chance for students to identify the words in videos.

#### **2.4 Effect of Subtitles on Content Comprehension**

The study conducted by Hinkin and Michael (2009) analyzed the impacts of watching movies with subtitles in comprehending the content of the movie. In order to examine the effects of subtitled movies, *A Few Good Men* and *See No Evil, Hear No Evil* were used. Only 10-minute movie clips from those movies were presented to participants. Besides, the researchers employed the data collection methods including three types of multiple-choice recognition questions for each movie. The first type of questions were based on only pictures. The second ones were related to verbal skills. The third type of ones were integrated information questions. This proceeds in two stages as experiment 1 and 2. Experiment 1 was based on exploring whether two modes of subtitling are different in comprehending when information was introduced verbally in their mother tongue. The findings of Experiment 1 show that the performances of participants were more satisfactory regarding the questions related to their verbal skills and information questions as a result of the presentation of the subtitles in their native tongue as an alternative to the soundtrack. When the performance of the participants were compared between the questions types such as the ones related to the only pictures and presentation formats, the findings highlight that participants watching the English program without subtitles outperformed notably all other conditions. Even though Experiment 1 is based on the understanding of the effects of soundtracks and subtitles in the mother tongue on movie comprehension, the videos including subtitles are fundamentally used when a foreign movie is watched with the help of verbal information. Additionally, Experiment 2 is in line with the findings of Experiment 1 by integrating an unfamiliar language. (i.e. French). The same setup was designed in Experiment 2 as similar to Experiment 1. Nevertheless, two French vocabulary tests were employed to take the measurements of acquiring the foreign language incidentally. The results of Experiment 2 are in a complete agreement with Experiment 1. That is to say, it is reported that participants could accomplish better in the conditions which involve the questions testing their oral skills and combined information after they watched it with the subtitles in their native language. This result offers significant evidence that the integration of subtitles helped the participants have higher scores.

Also, in Experiment 2, as performances in the condition that they were asked to answer the questions including only pictures were compared, it provided an evidence that there are no noteworthy differences. Furthermore, these two experiments reveal a clear advantage of using subtitles in watching movies. It is fundamental to note that the presence of a foreign language is correlated with a distraction effect. Participants could not perform well on the French vocabulary across all conditions and provided no worthy differences.

In order to properly address the question of which conditions of subtitling modes are more efficient on listening comprehension, Hayati and Mohmedi (2009) conducted a survey with intermediate level of Foreign Language students. With an effort to accomplish this aim successfully, 90 intermediate students were chosen and given a proficiency test. As the materials, six episodes which were named as Wild Weather were picked and shown 5 minutes for each one. Subsequently, English subtitles, Persian subtitles, no subtitles were utilized. The participants watched only one of the three different subtitling modes. In the time of following viewing each part, some multiple-choice questions were given to the participants with the aim of investigating which treatment group could get higher scores in listening comprehension. The results that emerged from the data make it clear that the English subtitles group could by a notably large amount of higher scores compared to the Persian subtitles. In addition, the findings point to the fact that the Persian subtitles outperformed the no subtitle group to a significant extent on the listening test.

In a study with a similar objective, Garza (1991) attempted to make a comparison of English and Russian learners with the aim of checking the benefit of subtitles on comprehension of video segments. One group was provided the closed-subtitled video segments whereas the other group watched them without subtitles. For gathering the information, a multiple-choice quiz was utilized by the researcher. The participants were allowed to complete this multiple-choice quiz after they viewed the videos as the first time or in the time of the second. Furthermore, apart from the multiple-choice quiz. A small of the participants were asked to take part in an oral activity. In this activity, the participants retold what they understood from the videos. The purpose of the oral re-telling activity is to take the measurements of what amount of the input they could benefit from the video in their oral productions. With the completion of these steps in the process of the study, the findings demonstrated that the achievement of the

Russian and English groups having access to the subtitles in videos was by a notably large amount higher than the other group viewing them without subtitles. It is obvious to note that incorporating subtitles into videos can facilitate the comprehension of learners and the usage of the expressions in their oral skills.

## **2.5 Selection of Movies For Classroom Use**

There are some concerns about choosing appropriate movies for language classrooms. It is important to take some issues into consideration for foreign language teachers who want to integrate movies into their lessons. Based on the statement of Berk (2009:6), it could be asserted that these noteworthy issues are the following three ones: (1) the criteria for selection of movies; (2) types of movies; and (3) sources for selection.

When it comes to the selection criteria, it is advisable that it is a better idea for teachers to select a movie which can be considered appropriate for their students. Gareis (1997) recommends that teachers had better keep away from movies which are based on controversial topics. That is to say, it is of importance for teachers to opt for a movie which is not risky to be brought into classes. Even though some materials are opted due to the reason of being safe for classroom use, they might have their own downsides because of the lack of learners' interest. It is noted that it could be really challenging to arouse the motivation of learners particularly if they are adolescent and adult learners. If it is expressed in different ways, the process of selecting movies for classes is quite complicated to deal with. As a further matter, it is significant to note that some certain issues should be paid attention by teachers about selecting the movie depending on what is the content of movie. Accordingly, regardless of the age of learners, there is a number of topics which are not suitable to be demonstrated in the classes such as too much violence, offensive language use, nudity, sexuality, and disgusting humor. With regard to the assertion of Gareis (1997:20), it is underlined that movies should be checked by teachers before integrating them into their classes. What is more, she points out that teachers ought to take the cultural and religious background of learners into account in case opt for inappropriate movies can lead to disappointment in learning process. If there is a difficulty in making sure about selecting appropriate movies for teachers, they might ask for the opinions of their students to make an easy decision related to whether the content of movie is potentially suitable to be displayed in class. In this way, teachers could not only get rid of the burden of choosing the right

one themselves but also prevent some probable objections about the content of the movie.

According to Berk (2009:7), there are three sets of criteria which are necessary to pay attention. These are concerned about the personality types of learners, how offensive the video is and video structure. When it comes to the first criteria, it can be said that it is associated with age, gender, ethnicity and grade level. From the perspectives of teachers, it could be stated that these are the critical points to be taken into consideration for picking the appropriate movie. Moreover, with regard to the second set of criteria, teachers might have difficulty in finding the right movie due to its content. Additionally, Berk (2009:7) states that if a learner is annoyed by the movie, s/he will lose her/his eagerness and motivation towards learning and foster his/her anger, which blocks the learning process. Accordingly, the fact that teacher makes a decision on the right movie based on the criteria mentioned above could be quite challenging. That is why, the thing teachers need to do is not to integrate any materials including offensive parts potentially with regard to the beliefs, values and their ethnicity. Apart from these two criteria, there is one more which is related the structure of the video. In other words, based on the assertion of Berk (2009:7) teachers should be attentive in finding the movie so that it might be appropriate in terms of its length, actions, context and number of characters. That is to say, it is importance of that there is no doubt in showing it in the class regarding all the concerns such as ethnicity, age, religion, and context.

In connection with the types of movies, Berk (2009:7) recommends some movies which are appropriate for instructional use such as drama, comedy, action, romantic comedy and documentaries. Also, Berk makes an emphasis on the fact that learners are affected by these different kinds of movies emotionally. Hence, the purpose of using movie in the class is closely connected with what type of the movie is integrated into the lesson. In other case, when the movie is chosen according to the concerns mentioned above, it might have negative impacts on learning process. Furthermore, Massi and Blazques (2012:63) point out that teachers could benefit from short movies which are defined as the ones whose images and sounds continue only thirty or fifteen minutes. To put it another way, they are called as mini-movies. These mini-movies can be categorized into three which involve animations, documentaries and live-action short movies. The first one, which is an animation, can be defined as a computer-

generated movie. The second type, documentary, is based on facts and ideas related to single topics. Besides, due to the fact that the purpose of the documentary is to present the reality, it is not possible to see actors unlike other movie types. The final type is live action short movies providing a story by actors and actresses.

Furthermore, a great deal of attention must be paid to the characteristics of the video when the movie is chosen for the classroom usage. Specifically, the fundamental criteria are that movies have clear picture and sound. It is significant to regard whether the dialogues and visual effects are well-balanced. In addition to the factors including dialogues, sound and visual support, it is noteworthy for teachers to choose a movie based on a clear and understandable accent. There might be a practical impact of using movies which include the standard accent for specifically beginner level of English learners. At this point, according to the belief of teachers, English language learners should be exposed to a variety of English accents so that they might be familiar with some different types of accents and dialects.

Vetrie (2004:42) describes another insight into the choice of movies in classrooms. Vetrie asserts that the movie teachers integrate into the language lessons need to be associated with their schemata and grab the attention of learners by having an influential and interesting story. As long as teachers give importance to the selection of movies based on those criteria mentioned above, they might find a chance to create a learning environment in which learners could enhance their communication skills. Vetrie claims that teachers should select a movie which is correlated with their experience and lives. With the help of the experience and relevance factors, there may be a dynamic learning environment where students gain critical thinking skills about the movie and explain their ideas orally. To put it another way, in line with the assertion of Vetrie, the key criteria is to select movies according the relevance of movies and learners' experience. Vetrie (2004: 42) prefers the term 'schemata' since it is a psychological term which introduces complicated reality or experience to define. In accordance with his belief, it might be stated that all teachers must gain insight into what their learners know and have experienced.

To put it another way, according to Vetrie, learners' background and video relevance are the significant factors for the choice of movies. He points out that teachers should find a way to connect their knowledge with the selection of movies. When it comes to the reason of his belief, it might be underlined that it is an easier way for teachers to

build a strong connection with movies and their previous experience or knowledge rather than building a new schemata. In addition, Stephens (2012: 16) draws our attention to the idea that learners need to be engaged in movies by applying their background knowledge. Therefore, there should be a close interconnection between the movies shown in classes and students' experience. Apart from it, movies should concern about the problems or issues of students in the classrooms. As long as the movies are concerned about the problems or the topics related to students' lives, better results could be seen in students' success. Based on Vetrie's (2004: 43) ideas, he reaches the conclusion that when students are shown a movie in class, it is observed that they succeed more in their writing and speaking skills. In other words, they could have better writing skills and explain their ideas better. With the help of their better speaking skills, the discussions are more intensified and engaging. As for some other points to be mentioned, it could be claimed that visual effects, pictures, sound and language usage, accent, the context of story, language level should preface some other factors as long as the content of the movie is engaging and informative. Arcario highlights that the selection of movies for classes is of utmost importance since the teacher should give importance to the considerations such as the relevancy of movies, educational purposes and learners' interests. Choosing the appropriate movie for class has a vital place on learners' participation in language learning process. It means that learners are profoundly affected by the selection of movies due to the fact that it has important impacts on learners' participation and motivation. As well as the participation and motivation, they could be more inspired and concentrated with the right movie in class (Stephens et al. 2012:16). Broadly speaking, the utility of the right movie in class has a considerable effect on learners' achievement. Therefore, it is necessary for teachers to make attentive choices before the movie is utilized in the class.

## **2.6. Conclusion**

This chapter is based on the literature review about using subtitles in language learning. It gives information about the process and findings of the previous studies concerning the impacts of subtitles on vocabulary and movie comprehension. Also, it informs about the criterias of selecting movies for classroom use. The following section will be related to the methodology of the study. Specifically, it will explain the

process of research design, settings and participants, data collection instrument, data analysis procedure.



## **CHAPTER III**

### **METHODOLOGY**

#### **3.1 Introduction**

In this chapter, the research design, setting and participants, data collection instrument, and data analysis procedure of the current research will be presented.

The integration of the movies into language learning process gives rise to the main question of whether English subtitles have any significant influence in English learning on the basis of the class experiences. Regarding the previous studies carried out before, it is indicated that English subtitles have an effect on language learning. However, this still remains a disputable question in the area. With the purpose of highlighting the case and finding out an answer to make a contribution to the field, the present study was carried out in order to see whether English subtitles are considerably effective or not regarding comprehending movie content and vocabulary items.

#### **3.2 Research Design**

This research was investigated as an experimental study including a control and an experimental group. A test was employed as a research tool. As for the researcher, she was one of the instructors teaching the advanced level classes in preparatory school at a foundation university. Also, four advanced level classes (B2) were included in this current study and these classes were picked in a random way. In other words, two advanced classes were chosen as a control group while other two classes were determined as an experimental group without any criteria apart from being advanced level class. With regard to the curriculum of the preparatory school, two weeks were allocated to carry out this experiment.

Prior to the experiment, the participants were told that they were going to watch two movies and then be tested about them in order to provide awareness related to the stages of research. At first, both groups watched the first documentary movie 'Dangerous Knowledge' and right after the students were asked to answer multiple

choice questions in line with vocabulary and content comprehension in their class time. Next, they watched the second documentary movie ‘Where is my robot?’ and answered the questions of vocabulary and content comprehension about this movie in their class time. In the experimental group, both movies were shown with English subtitles whereas the movies were shown without subtitles in the control group.

### **3.3. Treatment Instruments and Procedures**

In order to carry out this current study, two documentary movies taken from BBC were chosen. One of them was picked with English subtitles whereas the other one was chosen without subtitles. As for the subtitled one, it was *‘Dangerous Knowledge’* that was related to two different brilliant mathematicians- Greg Cantor and Ludwig Boltzmann. Georg Cantor was a mathematics professor, who began a revolution. This revolution was actually a threatening step to shake the world of mathematics and science. The revolution started with only one question: ‘How big infinity is?’ According to his belief, he was regarded as God’s Messenger and went insane with the effort of convincing people about his theories of infinity. Moreover, the second mathematician was Ludwig Boltzmann who attempted to justify his theory linked with the existence of atoms and possibility, which led him to commit a suicide. This documentary took fifty minutes to watch. The other movie without subtitles was ‘Where is my robot?’ This movie was about different types of robots. The speaker called Danny Wallace wanders around the globe with an attempt to find a robot that has the ability to walk and talk like a human. He finds out that the world of robots is so strange that it is quite complicated to understand. The duration of the second documentary was fifty minutes.

There were some crucial considerations to make a choice of the right movie such as an interesting content, the difficulty of language and duration of movies. Both documentary movies were utilized in classes with regard to these critical considerations. Additionally, the data were collected through two different tests. A set of fifteen multiple choice questions were employed in order to collect the data for the comprehension of the movie. Another set of fifteen multiple choice were used to gather information about the vocabulary for each movie. Also, the tests had four-choice questions which were based on the movies (Appendices A&B). In order to design such

an experiment, first the whole movies were watched by the researcher to see whether the theme and subject of the movies were appropriate and easy enough to understand. Subsequently, the movies were watched by the researcher in an attentive way regarding it part by part to prepare the comprehension multiple-choice questions. As for the vocabulary questions, they were based on advanced vocabulary. Some of the vocabulary items of the questions were taken from Cambridge and Oxford Advanced Learners' Dictionary. At this point, with the purpose of assessing the reliability of the tests, SPSS was used. Furthermore, it was stated that the reliability of the comprehension questions and vocabulary items was .756 that was regarded as sufficient for this type of test. In this current research, these tests were replicated from the previous study carried out by Etemadi (2012).

### **3.4. Settings and Participants**

This present research was performed in a preparatory school of a foundation university in Istanbul. As an international university, this university provides a diversity of research opportunities to the students from all around the world. It gives the students the chance to study at various departments in the body of the university. As for the medium of instruction, it is determined as English in many departments. Hence, the students are educated in English at the School of Foreign Languages in their first year with the aim of gaining competency of the language before their departmental programs. In other words, the students are required to learn English at the English Preparatory Program in most departments.

As for the setting of the classrooms, they are equipped with some technological devices including desktop computers with internet access, projectors and all essential class stuff. As well as the equipment, updated software programs of the books are integrated into the lessons to give an assistance to teachers. The Passages book by Cambridge Publishing is taught to the students in line with their levels. These books are provided to each student at the beginning of the year at the preparatory school. Students and teachers might benefit from all these instructional materials and equipment when required. This current research was conducted with the help of these gadgets.

As necessitated by the language education program of the institution, an online placement test is held to place students in the right level by the English Preparatory Program based on the Common European Framework of Reference (CEFR). The

students who have over sixty points on the test take a proficiency exam containing multiple choice questions. They are tested in terms of their vocabulary and grammar skills besides writing and speaking skills. Next, the students with over seventy points in the proficiency exam are allowed to study at their departmental programs. However, in the case that they fail in the examination system, they are placed in the classes regarding their levels as a consequence of the results of the placement test. These levels are stated in this way: A1, A2, B1, B1+, and B2. There are seven weeks in each level as it is called a module. The students completing the last module (B2) have the right to begin their departmental programs.

The current study was experimented with B2 level students regarded as advanced English language learners, in the fourth quarter of the English program in the 2018-2019 academic year in the preparatory school. Moreover, data was collected in four Advanced (B2) classes picked randomly among other advanced classes. The researcher was also the instructor of a B2 level class in that period. The study was carried out with the other three classes chosen randomly in the direction of other three instructors and the manager of the English program. Two B2 level classes were assigned as the experimental group randomly whereas the other two B2 level classes were determined as the control group.

#### **3.4.1 Experimental Group**

The experimental group included *thirty-two* students as the participants of the experiment. Their ages ranged from 18 to 22. Two different classes participated in the study as the experimental group. They were determined as the experimental group by the researcher randomly. The level of all the participants in the experimental group was B2 based on CEFR which means Common European Framework of Reference for Languages. Specifically, it is an international standard to describe language ability. It gives the description of language ability on a six point-scale, from A1 for beginners, up to C2 for the ones mastering a language. They were taught an extensive English education program with twenty-eight hours per week comprising of sixteen hours for main course, six hours for reading and writing, four hours for listening, two hours for consolidation class. The experimental group had the exposure of the experimental treatment in their class time in totally seventy minutes as watching the first movie for fifty minutes and taking the multiple choice test for 20 minutes in the first week of the treatment. Furthermore, in the second week of the treatment, they were asked to watch

the second documentary and take the test. To note a significant point, the experimental group viewed both movies with English subtitles.

### **3.4.2 Control Group**

There were *thirty-three* students in the control group. They were 18-22 years old. In the same way with the experimental group, they were B2 level students. Two different classes participated in the study as the experimental group. They were decided as the control group by the researcher randomly. The control group was exposed to English language program taking twenty-eight hours per week during the investigation. In the control group, the participants were asked to watch the first movie for fifty minutes and take the test for 20 minutes in the first week of the treatment in their class time in totally seventy minutes. Besides, in the second week of the treatment, they watched the second documentary and take the test. In other words, each stage of the treatment was the same with the experimental group. Nevertheless, the only difference between both groups was that the control group was shown the movies without subtitles.

### **3.5 Data Collection Instrument**

The participants were given information related to the process before the tests were distributed with the aim of increasing their motivation and attracting their attention. The participants were divided into two separate groups as the subtitled group and non-subtitled group. All of the participants were given information about the current research before the movies were watched in order to provide awareness and attract their attention. They were told that they were going to view two different English documentaries and were given two different tests including vocabulary and comprehension questions for each movie. Additionally, they were informed about whether they would watch it with or without English subtitles. Moreover, the mobile phones of the students were collected before they started to watch the movies. The reason why their mobile phones were collected from the students is to prevent any possible lack of attention and increase their concentration. At the beginning of the administration of the study, both subtitled and non-subtitled groups watched the same documentaries. However, it must be noted that the subtitled group watched first the documentary 'Dangerous Knowledge' and then 'Where is my robot?' which both took fifty minutes. Both movies were shown with English subtitles. The movies were

presented in different sessions. On the other hand, the non-subtitled group were shown both documentaries in different sessions without subtitles. They were given the same instructions and same information. After the participants were asked to watch the movies, both classes received two separate tests involving vocabulary and content comprehension questions linked with the movies. They had 20 minutes to answer both vocabulary and content comprehension questions for each movie.

### **3.6 Data Analysis Procedure**

The data in this study included the answers of the multiple choice questions connected with content comprehension and vocabulary recognition. The participants took one point for each correct question. The data collected were administered to the statistical procedures of SPSS. Specifically, an independent samples *t*-test was run in this study. The reason why the Independent Samples *t* Test was used is to compare the means of two independent groups so as to decide if there is statistical evidence that the means of the participants are considerably different. During the data analysis procedure, at first, the scores were computed. There were two separate study groups as subtitled and non-subtitled. Furthermore, there were two main different categories including vocabulary recognition and content comprehension to be compared. Each participant had 4 scores. One was for the comprehension question of the first documentary 'Dangerous Knowledge'. One was for vocabulary question of the first documentary 'Dangerous Knowledge'. Another was for the comprehension question of the second documentary 'Where is My Robot?' The other one was for the vocabulary question of the same documentary. To put it another way, two scores were calculated for comprehension questions of the movies whereas two other scores were calculated for the content comprehension questions of the movies for each participants. Two separate groups as subtitled and non-subtitled were compared in terms of their vocabulary recognition and content comprehension of the movies by applying an independent samples *t*-test. In other words, the results of subtitled group was compared with the ones of non-subtitled group on vocabulary recognition of the movies. Additionally, the results of subtitled group were compared with the ones of non-subtitled group on content comprehension of the movies. The next chapter will present the results of the data analysis and discussion part.

### **3.7 Conclusion**

This chapter is related to the presentation of the methodology containing the research design, setting and participants, data collection instrument, and data analysis procedure. The research design gives the information about how the research was organized during the experimentation process. Setting was determined as a preparatory school at a foundation university. Additionally, the participants were placed in the experimental and control group. As for the data collection instrument, the application employs data obtained from multiple choice tests in line with the content comprehension of two BBC documentary movies (*'Dangerous Knowledge'* and *'Where is my robot?'*). In order to analyze the data, an independent samples *t-test* was utilized by the researcher. The next section will inform about the major findings obtained from the data analysis and then the results.

## **CHAPTER IV**

### **FINDINGS & RESULTS**

#### **4.1. Introduction**

This chapter identifies the findings of the data revealed from the independent samples t-test. The research questions will be indicated with the conclusions. In response to the first research question of the current study, there will be descriptive statistics of the test of both control and experimental groups in a table. Subsequently, in order to response to the second research question, the findings will be reported with the explanations. Lastly, the results of data analysis will be summarized and findings will be presented.

The present study is based on two main research questions. They will be indicated with the findings obtained from an independent samples t-test respectively.

1. Is there any significant difference between the group watching the subtitled documentaries and the group watching them without subtitles on their comprehension of the movie?
2. Is there any significant difference between the group treated with movie subtitles and the group treatment without any subtitles on their vocabulary recognition

#### **4.1. Results**

An independent samples t-test was conducted to examine the influences of subtitles on content of comprehension and vocabulary comprehension of English documentaries. Firstly, Levene's test was checked to see whether variances were homogeneous or not. The results showed that variances were homogeneous. That's why, equal variances were assumed in the analysis.

##### **4.1.1 Movie Comprehension**

1. Is there any significant difference between the group watching the subtitled documentaries and the group watching them without subtitles on their comprehension of the movie?

Table 1 reports that there was not a significant difference between the two groups for subtitle group ( $M=10, SD=3, 94$ ), and for no subtitle group ( $M=9, SD= 3, 16$ );  $t (63) = .63, p > .05$ . They demonstrated that subtitle does not have a significant effect on comprehension of a documentary.

**Table 4.1: Movie Comprehension 1**

Group	<i>N</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>t</i>	<i>df</i>	<i>p</i>
Subtitle	32	10,28	3,94	-.625	63	.53
Non-subtitle	33	9,72	3,16			

#### 4.1.2 Vocabulary Comprehension

1. Is there any significant difference between the group treated with movie subtitles and the group treatment without any subtitles on their vocabulary recognition?

Table 2 presents the result that there was a significant difference between the two groups for no subtitle group ( $M=10, SD=3, 7$ ) and for subtitle group ( $M= 7, SD=4, 22$ );  $t (63) = 2, 62, p < .05$ . These results suggest that the non-subtitle group significantly outperformed the subtitle group.

**Table 4.2: Vocabulary Comprehension 1**

Group	<i>N</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>t</i>	<i>df</i>	<i>p</i>
Subtitle	32	7,93	4,22	2,61	61,32	0,11
Non-subtitle	33	10,51	3,69			

Overall, with regard to the results drawn from data analysis and presented in the table 1 and table 2 above, it is revealed that subtitle does not have a significant impact on content comprehension of movies. On the other hand, it is concluded that subtitles are

not effective on the vocabulary comprehension of movies. In this study, the efficacy of subtitles was analyzed, and the findings demonstrate that subtitle does not have an important effect on content and vocabulary comprehension in movies.

### **4.3. Conclusion**

In this chapter, the findings analyzed on SPSS v.22. were reported and then discussed. The two main research questions were explained through discussion of the experiment. It was explained that these research questions were analyzed through quantitative analysis method. The data was obtained from the experimental and control group. With an attempt to the analysis of the first research question, an independent samples t-test on SPSS v.22. was utilized to analyze the data of both the experimental and control group. As result of the analysis of the first research question, it was detected that there are not any meaningful differences between the experimental and control group in terms of using subtitles of the movies on content comprehension. To put it another way, the use of subtitles does not have an impact regarding the content comprehension. As for the analysis of the second question, it was analyzed through the same method mentioned above. It was highlighted that there are meaningful differences between the experimental and control group with the use of subtitles on the vocabulary comprehension of movies. In other words, the non-subtitle group outperformed the subtitled group with regard to the vocabulary comprehension of the movies. The following chapter will refer to the discussion of the findings, conclusion of the present research and some suggestions for further studies.

## **CHAPTER V**

### **DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION**

#### **5.1. Introduction**

This chapter includes a discussion associated with the findings analyzed statistically and then their implications will be presented. Additionally, the recommendations for future work regarding the subtitling strategy will be given. As the last section of the chapter, a conclusion to the current research will be provided.

#### **5.2. Discussion of the Findings**

In line with the claim of King (2002), it might be stated that English language learners can take an advantage of movies in their learning process since movies are regarded as a rich resource in terms of providing many pedagogical benefits as well as being a motivational source. That is to say, the exposure to the movies in language learning is closely associated with the learning vocabulary and improvement of the target language. Particularly, the way learners view movies might be attributed to the specific influence on their learning such as watching them with subtitles. Besides, According to Kusumarasyati (2005), it is asserted that the usage of subtitles in watching English movies assists the learners to enhance their comprehension and language learning. Regarding the findings of the previous studies on the effect of subtitles in English movies especially on content comprehension and vocabulary recognition, it is highlighted that using subtitles in English movies has an impact upon the comprehension while it does not have an impact on vocabulary recognition. That is to say, the effectiveness of subtitles is verified in only content comprehension of movies but not vocabulary recognition. In this context, the results obtained from the pioneering studies paved the way of other researchers who are focused on the integration of subtitled movies into the language classes. The researchers interested in exploring the effectiveness of watching English subtitled movies manage to conduct some experimental studies in line with the content comprehension, vocabulary comprehension, studying fluency, accuracy and so forth.

With this in mind, the inspiration of the previous studies led the current study to be conducted in order to cast a light on the integration of English subtitled movies into EFL classes in Turkish context. To put it another way, the aim of this work is to take a look at the similar issue of EFL context and bridge a gap in Turkey by investigating the influence of subtitles in English movies in line with content comprehension of movies and vocabulary recognition. With this object in mind, a post-test was utilized with a control and experimental group in an EFL classroom setting. The obtained data from the tests related to vocabulary and comprehension of movies was analyzed through an independent samples *t-test* on SPSS v.22. Consequently, the findings of the current research will be discussed below with the comparison of pioneering studies carried out about the effectiveness of English subtitles connected with the vocabulary comprehension and content comprehension.

Referring to Table 1 the most remarkable result to emerge from the data is that the participants did not perform well on comprehension of movies when the movies were played with English subtitles. According to the data obtained from tests, it could be highlighted that the usage of subtitles showed no meaningful difference on movie comprehension. It is fundamental to note that subtitle is not influential on movie comprehension for EFL learners. This surprising result of the current study is not consistent with the findings of pioneering studies. In other words, this result significantly differed from the previous results reported in the literature. Specifically, The result of the current research does not lend support to the findings of the study carried out by Garza (1991). Although Garza (1991) found a significant correlation between the usage of subtitles and movie comprehension, based on the current study, it is demonstrated that the integration of subtitles did not facilitate to comprehend the movies. As it is seen, the finding of the present study disprove the results of the previous study done by Garza (1991). Moreover, the result of the current study does not seek to confirm the findings of the research done by Hayati, M. & Mohmedi, and F. (2009).

That is to say, in accordance with the result emerged from the data on movie comprehension about using subtitles in movies, it makes clear that viewing movies with subtitles might notably enhance the comprehension of movies. Subtitle gives a support to learners to facilitate their comprehension in watching foreign movies. In fact, in contrast with what was previously found, the present research has found that

the utility of subtitles in watching movies does not notably have an impact upon movie comprehension. Accordingly, the finding of the current research with regard to the usage of subtitles in movie comprehension is in contradiction with the results obtained from the study conducted by Garza (1991) and Hayati & Mohmedi (2009). In this sense, this study provided an evidence in contrast with the previous studies done by some other researchers mentioned above regarding whether the utility of subtitles is notably effective or not to comprehend a foreign movie.

On the other hand, the statistical analysis obtained from the study of Hinkin, M. (2009) indicate that watching movies without subtitles is more effective in order to comprehend a movie. At this point, this result correlates well with the finding of the current research. To put it another way, both studies are in agreement with the idea that subtitles should be utilized in order to facilitate the comprehension of movies. Hence, it is worth mentioning that the usefulness of subtitles might be validated by the current study in providing additional support in the literature.

Taken as a whole, despite some contradictions with the previous results in the literature, the marked observation to emerge from the data comparison is that subtitles are not notably influential in movie comprehension for EFL learners based on the indication of the statistical analysis. Notwithstanding the lack of agreement, the findings with regard to the utility of subtitles in movie comprehension are noteworthy to prove a different evidence and lead to a new discussion in the field. Furthermore, the results of the pioneering studies need to be interpreted with extreme caution as the setting of the study, the number and language background of the participants, their lack of concentration play a significant role in the discussion of the findings. Thus, the conclusions of the review should be treated with considerable caution so that reliable findings could be obtained to cast a light on the field. With this point in mind, in accordance with the current research, the findings might be interpreted with some crucial points explaining the reason why the utility of subtitles does not have a significant effect on movie comprehension. At first, subtitles might not have had an impact upon the comprehension of the participants in the current research, as it might have been hard to follow image, sound and text for the subtitled group at the same time. As it is a requirement of viewing a subtitled movie, the participants should have both advanced listening and reading skills in order to comprehend movies well. Despite the fact that the participants were chosen among the advanced level learners

for the study, as mentioned above related to the limitations of the study, there might have had some learners with low level listening and reading skills in the subtitled group.

Another possible explanation might be that more low level learners may have been in the subtitled group compared to the non-subtitled group. In other words, both groups were chosen among only advanced level learners. However, there were some students who had better language background. The participation of those low-level learners in the subtitled group might have decreased the value of using subtitles.

Also, it is necessary to tell that the usage of subtitles may not show a crucial difference in comprehension since the documentaries used in the study were based on many scientific words which might have made the comprehension of the participants more challenging. That is to say, some unfamiliar scientific words may lead to a difficult comprehension process for even advanced level of learners.

Lastly, the sleepiness and lack of concentration towards the selection of movie type can affect some participants' performance. Just to clarify, motivation, concentration and sleepiness are considerable factors affecting the comprehension of movies. Consequently, the participants who were exposed to BBC documentaries with English subtitles could have showed poor performance due to the reasons related to concentration time and different interests in movies.

In line with the Table 2, it was detected that subtitled group outperformed the non-subtitled group on vocabulary comprehension. It is surprising to note that the result casts a light on the lack of subtitles in movies on vocabulary comprehension. Accordingly, the finding of the current research does not provide an evidence of the effectiveness of subtitles on vocabulary comprehension. It might be said that the utility of subtitles does not facilitate learners to comprehend vocabulary items in foreign movies. However, when this current result is compared to the ones of the older studies, it must be pointed out that the result of the current study does not appear to corroborate with the previous studies with regard to vocabulary comprehension. Particularly, according to the study of Neuman and Koskinen (1992), it is obvious that there are many benefits of watching movies with subtitles on vocabulary comprehension. On the other hand, the current research does not support the idea that watching subtitled movies brings more benefits than watching them without subtitles regarding the

vocabulary comprehension. In other words, the findings of the present research significantly differ from the results of previous studies.

Furthermore, the results of the current study are not in an agreement with the pioneering studies in terms of comprehending the vocabulary items after watching movies with or without subtitles. In the study of Danan and Holobow, the fact that subtitles are incorporated into movies makes recalling of the vocabulary items heard easier for learners. It could be said that subtitles of movies play an important role in recalling vocabulary items as an effective way of learning. At this point, even though the study of Danan and Holobow gives a support to incorporate subtitles into movies, the current study is not consistent with it due to the finding revealing that viewing non-subtitled movies is more efficient than subtitled movies.

Besides, when the current research was compared to the studies carried out by Koostra, Jonannes and Beentjes (1999), Chai, Judy and Erlam, Rosemary (2008), it must be pointed out that the results of present research do not correlate with these studies mentioned above with regard to the incorporation of subtitles into movies on vocabulary recognition. That is to say, the current study is in favor of the idea that non-subtitled movies have a beneficial impact upon vocabulary comprehension compared to subtitled movies. However, the studies carried out by Koostra, Joannes and Beentjes (1999) provide a considerable insight into the usage of subtitled movies in recalling vocabulary items. Based on the findings of the previous research, the results offer a crucial evidence for using subtitled movies.

On top of that, in spite of some contradictions with the previous results in the literature, the marked observation to emerge from the data comparison is that subtitles are not notably influential on vocabulary comprehension for EFL learners as a consequence of the indication of the statistical analysis. To put it another way, with reference to the study carried out by Aisyarani (2014) in order to find the correlation between the integration of subtitles movies for vocabulary comprehension, it is obtained that watching movies with or without subtitles does not have any significant influence on recognizing the vocabulary items heard or seen in the movies. That is to say, it could be said that the results obtained by Aisyarani (2014) do not confirm the belief stating the utility of subtitles in movies enhances learners' vocabulary comprehension. Consequently, it demonstrates that subtitled or non-subtitled movies do not differ in the improvement of vocabulary for EFL learners. At this point, it is noteworthy

mentioning that the results of the previous studies do not appear to corroborate with the findings emerged from the data of the present study in connection with the influence of subtitles on vocabulary comprehension.

As a consequence of the comparisons made above with the aim of discussing whether the results of the previous studies are consistent with the results of the present research, it would be reasonable to tell that the findings are not in an agreement with the previous ones in the literature touching on the impact of subtitled movies on vocabulary recognition. In other words, all the studies referred above highlight the result that subtitled movies facilitate language learners to comprehend the vocabulary items in movies whereas the finding of the current study reveals that non-subtitled movies are considerably influential in the performance of EFL learners in the context of recalling vocabulary items. Regardless of the inconsistency between the findings, the results of the current research should be treated with the utmost caution with the purpose of providing a deeper insight concerning the reason why the findings of the current research are not consistent with the others in the literature. As long as a careful attention is paid in the interpretation of the conclusions, it is fundamental to explain some crucial points of the current study. Bearing in mind that the current study highlights the result that non-subtitled movies are more effective than subtitled movies with regard to vocabulary comprehension, it could be said that subtitle does not play a significant role on learners' vocabulary comprehension, which means it does not have an impact upon vocabulary in contrast with other studies carried out previously in the literature. As for the main reason why non-subtitled group outperformed the subtitled group in the study, the first cause might be that the participants in the non-subtitled group could have been familiar with the vocabulary items heard in the documentary movies, which leads to higher performance in the test. Even if the participants could have a chance to see the words in the documentary, they might not have deduced the meanings of the words easily due to the lack of familiarity. Apart from that, the participants of the non-subtitled group might have better language background compared to the ones in the subtitled group. The fact that they might have better language background enabled the participants to get the understanding of the movies and do better in the tests. As a last remark, it could be noted that concentration and interests towards the selected documentaries might have been influential on the participants of non-subtitled group. Just to make it clear, the possibility that the

majority of non-subtitled group were more interested in watching documentaries might make the participants more motivated to keep their concentration time longer during the process. On that account, it is possible to tell that the participants in the non-subtitled group showed higher performance in the tests owing to some probable factors affecting their performance such as motivation, interests, concentration and language background. Hence, in accordance with the findings emerged from the data in the current study, it is crucial to note that subtitles in movies do not have a considerable impact upon vocabulary comprehension.

### **5.3. Suggestions for the Further Studies**

In this current study, the aim is to find out whether there is any significant influence of English subtitles on content comprehension of English movie and vocabulary comprehension with L2 learners in an EFL classroom setting. Bearing in mind some limitations and the findings drawn from the present study mentioned above, some recommendations will be presented for further studies regarding the integration of movies into EFL classes.

As stated above for the constraints of the current study, future investigations are essential to validate the kinds of conclusions that can be drawn from this study with the help of more participants in EFL settings. To explain, as 65 participants were involved in this present research, it would be more grounded to have more participants with the aim of generalizing the results of the present investigation to a large scale. In this sense, it would be highly acceptable to provide more participants to be involved in the research.

Looking forward, further attempts could prove quite beneficial by integrating different levels of EFL learners into the research since it might be a good idea to make a comparison of different levels of participants related to the usage of subtitles in watching movies. The present study was intended to analyze the effect of subtitles in only advanced level of learners which were B2 level of students. Namely, in order to have a broad statement of the influence of subtitles in EFL learners, future studies could fruitfully explore this issue further by investigating it with the integration of all levels of EFL learners.

Apart from the things aforementioned, also a study, which is an attempt to examine the possible effect of English subtitles on vocabulary comprehension of movies should

be devoted to the development of the results of the current study. The present study was conducted to analyze the influence of subtitling on vocabulary comprehension of movies. As one of the limitations of the current study, duration of the experiment was limited due to the curriculum of the preparatory school. As a consequence of that limitation, the participants were exposed to the movies only once. However, it was required for the participants to watch the movies more than once so that more reliable results could have been obtained on vocabulary comprehension of movies. To put it another way, it is desirable for future work to increase watching frequency of the movies in order to obtain more valid results based on the issue of recognizing vocabulary items.

In addition, the fact that the participants are used to watching the movies with or without subtitles has an impact on the findings of the present study since the background or language experience of the participants might be influential on the performance during the experimentation. Thus, future work is certainly required to disentangle this complexity in the findings of the current research. This is very much the key component in future attempts to overcome it through a questionnaire related to the language background of the participants regarding their habits or preferences in watching movies as a pre-test. In this way, the initial findings of the present study might be analyzed more strategically to get more reliable results.

As well as the suggestions given above, to our knowledge, the analysis of the findings leads to the need of further investigation on other skills of the language such as speaking and listening. Namely, the results of the present study provide a basis on vocabulary and comprehension regardless touching upon the skills of speaking and listening. Future attempts should add to a growing corpus of research investigating these mentioned issues by means of different kinds of tests and methods so that future research might extend the explanations of the subtitling strategy in movies on the whole aspects of the language.

#### **5.4 Conclusion**

Taken together, this research thesis concerning watching English movies with subtitles points towards the idea that films are not regarded only as a way of entertaining learners, but also it is possible to give an assistance to language learners and provide some beneficial input of the language with a variety of accents. That is to say, with the

assistance of movies, language learners are provided a learning environment that they can have a familiarity with the authentic language spoken by people with a variety of accents. Accordingly, they are not exposed to only one accent of the language, which enables them to get deeper insight of the language they are learning. On the other hand, it might be a bit demanding for learners to pay attention to each word in movies since they are familiar with the Standard English. As a further matter, that is an advantageous practice in order to have an acquaintance with a variety of accents of English around the world. In that sense, subtitles are regarded as a crucial choice to facilitate the learners' comprehension of the movies.

Over and above that, in line with the previous studies carried out in the literature, they provided an evidence indicating that subtitle plays a significant role on movie comprehension but not on vocabulary recognition. To put it another way, the evidence from the pioneering studies indicate that subtitles might be utilized with the purpose of promoting the comprehension of learners as a practical way of learning. On the other hand, in connection with the findings of the previous studies related to vocabulary recognition, the main conclusion that can be drawn is that subtitle does not have a vital impact upon comprehending the vocabulary items in movies.

Inspired by other studies carried out previously, this research paper aims to investigate the effect of subtitles of movies regarding content comprehension and vocabulary comprehension of English movies for EFL learners. Specifically, the main purpose of the current study is to find out the possible difference between subtitled group and non-subtitled group in connection with the factors including content comprehension and vocabulary recognition. In the light of the background of the study, the experiment was performed with an experimental and a control group. Also, 65 EFL learners participated in the research to make a contribution. In an attempt to examine the possible impact of subtitles, two BBC documentaries were selected by taking into consideration the content and language difficulty. The data was collected with a multiple choice test involving comprehension and vocabulary questions selected from the movies. It was analyzed with an independent samples t-test. According to the results of the study, it reveals that subtitle is not considerably influential on movie comprehension. On the top of that, the findings point towards the idea that the absence of subtitles in movies provides learners to comprehend the vocabulary items. On the account of that, it is proper to tell that subtitle is not significantly effective on movie

comprehension although it has a considerable effect on vocabulary recognition. At this point, it is obvious that the current research is in contrast with the results of the previous studies in the literature. Hence, bearing in mind the findings, this study refutes the notion that subtitle is notably influential on movie and vocabulary comprehension in EFL context. In spite of all the contradictions with the previous studies, it is noteworthy for this research paper to provide a different evidence and pave the way of a new discussion in the field.



## REFERENCES

- Baltova, I. (1999). Multisensory language teaching in a multidimensional curriculum: The use of authentic bimodal video in core French. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 56: 31-48.
- Berk, Ronald A. (2009). Multimedia teaching with video clips: TV, movies, YouTube, and MTV in the college classroom. *International Journal of Technology in Teaching and Learning*, 5(1): 1-21.
- Borrás, I., & Lafayette, R.C. (1994). Effects of multimedia courseware subtitling on the speaking performance of college students of French. *The Modern Language Journal*, 78: 61-75.
- Borras, I. & R.G. Lafayette. (1994). Effects of multimedia courseware subtitling on the speaking performance of college students of French. *The Modern Language Journal*, 78(1): 66-75.
- Canning-Wilson, C., & Wallace, J. (2000). Practical aspects of using video in the foreign language classroom. *The Internet TESL Journal*, 6: 36-31.
- Chai, Judy & Erlam, Rosemary (2008). The Effect and the Influence of the Use of Video and Subtitles on Second Language Learning. *New Zealand Studies in Applied Linguistics*, 14(2): 25-44.
- Danan (1992) & Holobow, N. E., Lambert, W. E. & Sayegh, L. (1984). Pairing script and dialogue: combinations that show promise for second or foreign language learning. *Language Learning*, 34(4): 59–76.
- Danan, M. (1992). Reversed subtitling and dual coding theory: New direction for foreign language instruction. *Language Learning*, 42(4): 497–527.
- Gareis, Elisabeth (1997). Movies in the language classroom: Dealing with problematic content. *TESOL Journal*, 6(4): 20-23.
- Garza, T. J. (1991). Evaluating the use of subtitled video materials in advanced foreign language learning. *Foreign Language Annals*, 24(3): 239-258.
- Grgurović, M. & Hegelheimer, V. (2007). Help options and multimedia listening: Students' use of subtitles and the transcript. *Language Learning & Technology*, 11(1). <http://llt.msu.edu/vol11num1/pdf/grgurovic.pdf> [September 26].
- Grignon, P., J. M. Lavour & N. Blanc. (2005). The effect of subtitles on film understanding. [sites.google.com/site/jeanmarclavour/grignonlavourblanc2007.pdf](http://sites.google.com/site/jeanmarclavour/grignonlavourblanc2007.pdf) [April 29].
- Hayati, M. & Mohmedi, F. (2009). The effect of films with and without subtitles on listening comprehension of EFL learners. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 42(1). <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2009.01004.x> [April 18].
- Hinkin, M. (2009). Comprehension of multiple channel messages: Are subtitles more beneficial than soundtracks? <http://krex.kstate.edu/dspace/bitstream/2097/1679/1/MichaelHinkin2009.pdf> [September 26].

- Karakas, A. (2012). The Impact of Watching Subtitled Animated Cartoons on Incidental Vocabulary Learning of ELT Students. *Teaching English with Technology*, 12(4). <http://www.tewtjournal.org> [January 16].
- Kikuchi, T. (1997). A review of research on the education use of English captioned materials in Japan. *Retrieved October, 14: 2005*
- King, J. (2002). Using DVD feature films in the EFL classroom. *ELT Newsletter*, The weekly column, Article <http://www.eltnewsletter.com/back/February2002/art882002.htm> [January 5].
- Koolstra, C. M. & J. W. J. Beentjes. (1999). Children's vocabulary acquisition in a foreign language through watching subtitled television programs at home. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 47(1). <http://www.springerlink.com/content/7951541774721423/> [August 11].
- Koskinen, P., Knable, J., Jensema, C., Markham, P., & Kane, K. (1995). Subtitled television and the vocabulary acquisition of adult second language correctional facility residents. *Journal of Educational Technology Systems*, 24(4): 359-373.
- Kusumarasdyati. (2005). Subtitled Movie DVDs in Foreign Language Classes. Monash University. <http://www.aare.edu.au/06pap/kus06105.pdf> [April 29].
- Kothari, B., Pandey, A. & Chudgar, A. R. (2004). Reading out of the Idiot Box: same-language subtitling on television in India. *Information Technologies and International Development*, 2(1): 73-85.
- Lertola, J. (2012). The effect of the subtitling task on vocabulary learning. [http://isg.urv.es/publicity/isg/publications/trp\\_4\\_2012/index.htm](http://isg.urv.es/publicity/isg/publications/trp_4_2012/index.htm) [February 15].
- Lewis, M. & Anping, H. (2002). Video-viewing tasks for language teacher education. *The RELC Journal*, 33(1): 122–136.
- Markham, P. (1999). Subtitled Videotapes and Second Language Listening Word Recognition. *Foreign Language Annals*, 32(3). <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1944.9720.1999.tb01344.x/abstract> [January 15].
- Massi, Maria Palmira and Bettiana Andrea Blazquez (2012). A short is worth a thousand films! *Teaching English with Technology*, 12(3): 62-86
- Meskill, C. (1996). Listening skills development through multimedia. *Journal of Educational Multimedia and Hypermedia*, 5: 179-201.
- National Center for Technology Innovation and Center for Implementing Technology in Education (CITEd). (2010). Captioned Media: Literacy Support for Diverse Learners. <http://www.readingrockets.org/article/35793> [September 26].
- Neuman, S. B., & Koskinen, P. (1992). Captioned television as comprehensible input: Effects of incidental word learning from context for language minority students. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 1: 94-106.
- Neuman, S. B. & Koskinen, P. (1992). Subtitled television as comprehensible input: effects of incidental word learning from context for language minority students. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 27(1): 95–106.

- Stephens, Crissa, Ascencio, Rocio, Burgos, Ana Luisa, Diaz, Tatiana, Montenegro, Jimena and Christian Valenzuela (2012). Film circles: Scaffolding speaking for EFL students. *English Teaching Forum*, 50(2): 14-20.
- Stewart, M. & Pertusa, I. (2004). Gains to language learners from viewing target language closed-subtitled films. *Foreign Language Annals*, 37(3). <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1944-9720.2004.tb02701.x> [February 22].
- Sydorenko, T. (2010). Modality of Input and Vocabulary. *Language Learning & Technology*, 14(2): 50–73. <http://llt.msu.edu/vol14num2/sydorenko.pdf> [January 25].
- Vanderplank, R. (1988). The value of teletext sub-titles in language learning. *ELT journal*, 42: 272-281.
- Vetrie, Michael. (2004). Using film to increase literacy skills. *English Journal*, 93(3): 39-45.
- Weyer, J. R. (1999). The effect of authentic video on communicative competence. *The Modern Language Journal*, 83(3): 339–349.
- Zanon, N. T. (2006). Using subtitles to enhance foreign language learning. *Porta Linguarum*, 6. [http://www.ugr.es/~portalin/articulos/PL\\_numero6/talavan.pdf](http://www.ugr.es/~portalin/articulos/PL_numero6/talavan.pdf) [September 29].

## APPENDICES

### APPENDICES A: The movie test I

Name Surname:

Number:

#### THE MOVIE TEST I: Dangerous Knowledge

##### *Part A: Comprehension*

Choose the correct option and circle around it.

1. Who was Georg Cantor?

- a) A philosopher      b) A physicist      c) A mathematician      d) A scientist

2. Cantor started the revolution by asking the question .....

- a) What is infinity?      c) Is there any infinity?  
b) How big is infinity?      d) How can infinity be proved?

3. What did Cantor find after his first publication?

- a) Infinity is a vague number without end.  
b) He could not prove continuum hypothesis.  
c) Set theory is not true.  
d) He could add and subtract infinity.

4. Where did Cantor spend his entire professional life?

- a) In the asylum      b) In the Alps  
c) In the lecture theater in the university      d) In his hometown, Hallie

5. What was Cantor's dream?

- a) To prove continuum hypothesis  
b) To receive an invitation to one of the great universities  
c) To publish his work  
d) To meet his friend in the Alps

6. What did his friend and teacher, Kronecker, say about Cantor?

He said he was .....

- a) a corrupter of youth
- b) a math sicker
- c) the father of mathematics
- d) a great scientist

7. What is the most precious possession of Cantor's?

- a) His publication
- b) His father's letter
- c) His continuum hypothesis
- d) His set theory

8. Which statement is not true about Cantor?

- a) He proved the continuum hypothesis.
- b) He worked on the continuum hypothesis for the rest of his life.
- c) He had the musical talent.
- d) He never fully recovered.

9. Who was Ludwig Boltzmann?

- a) A scientist
- b) A professor
- c) A physicist
- d) A mathematician

10. What was the common aspect of Greg Cantor and Ludwig Boltzmann?

- a) they were both out of step with their times
- b) they both taught at the same university in Vienna
- c) they were both scientists in physics
- d) they both made publications in maths.

11. What were his theories based on?

- a) infinity
- b) probability
- c) certainty
- d) creativity

12. Why could not he be fully accepted by German Physicists? Because.....

- a) He was unrevolutionary.
- b) He worked on atoms .
- c) He emphasized the certainty.
- d) He did not make a change in the field.

13. Who was the scientist that Boltzmann admired most?

a) Charles Darwin      b) Ernst March      c) Goethe Faust      d) Greg Kantor

14. Which one was not mentioned about Boltzmann' personality traits?

a) passionate      b) stubborn      c) self-ironic      d) submissive

15. What did not Boltzmann do in the last 10 years of his life?

a) He tried to make his point      b) He wrote books.  
c) He repeated the same concept.      d) He accepted the theory of certainty.

**Part B: Vocabulary**

1. Most of the people are in the ..... of happiness in their lives; some will reach it but others won't.

a) realm      b) tinge      c) pursuit      d) haste

2. I think I managed to ..... the main points of the lecture.

a) detain      b) grasp      c) deter      d) glance

3. They showed obvious hostility towards their new neighbors.

a) hospitality      b) hatred      c) havoc      d) humility

4. The government is planning to ..... a bench marking scheme to guide consumers.

a) excel      b) launch      c) abolish      d) alter

5. Most of the students living in the dormitory in Iran have many adversities, which they have to overcome.

a) nuances      b) differences      c) pretexts      d) difficulties

6. It took a lot of ..... to stand up and criticize the chairman.

a) asperity      b) brutality      c) audacity      d) brevity

7. We are ..... affected by what happens to us in childhood.

a) interminably      b) profoundly      c) indiscriminately      d) pragmatically

8. On this occasion we pay ..... to him for his achievements.

a) homicide      b) budget      c) homage      d) blunder

9. We've got a long way to go before we unravel the secrets of genetics.

- a) abandon                      b) conceal                      c) reveal                      d) blend

10. The essential process involves a ..... change of state, i.e., liquid to vapor to liquid.

- a) reversible                      b) irreversible                      c) excusable                      d) durable

11. People have a natural tendency to rebel against entropy to return order to their environments.

- a) enterprise                      b) improvement                      c) progress                      d) decay

12. Peter struggled to break free, but suddenly there were knives all around him and he was held down.

- a) attempted                      b) surrendered                      c) retreated                      d) escaped

13. If an issue is ....., , relevant opinions as well as facts may need to be considered.

- a) agreeable                      b) controversial                      c) unquestionable                      d) incontrovertible

14. McCarthy said he wanted ..... on whether or not the car park would contravene the development plan as it was not explained enough.

- a) accumulation                      b) complication                      c) clarification                      d) repression

15. Police were today hunting thugs who unleashed a pack of hunting dogs to kill deer in a National Trust park.

- a) held                      b) restrained                      c) injured                      d) released

## APPENDICES B: The movie test II

Name- Surname:

Number:

### MOVIE TEST II: Where Is My Robot?

#### *Part A: Comprehension*

*Choose the correct option and circle around it.*

1. What did Danny quest for? The ..... robot.

- a) beautiful                      b) intelligent                      c) perfect                      d) walking

2. Which robot was in the Stanford University lab?

- a) Stair                      b) Domo                      c) HRP3                      d) Robotic

101

3. Why didn't Andrew tell Danny that Stair could talk? Because he .....

- a) thought Danny might know it                      c) forgot to do so  
b) thought it was something ordinary                      d) wanted to surprise him

4. Why is HRP3 unique in walking robots? Because .....

- a) It can turn around                      b) It doesn't need to be pre-programmed  
c) It can both talk and walk                      d) If it falls down, it can get up by itself

5. Where is HRP3 supposed to work?

- a) In the office                      c) In construction  
b) In surgery                      d) In the laboratory

6. Which statement is NOT true about HRP3?

- a) It is very expensive.                      b) It can tackle a large bump.  
c) It is a robust manual worker.                      d) It is a super robot.

7. Why does Domo need a vision system?

- a) To recognize human faces                      b) To detect color objects  
c) To make sense of the world                      d) To walk through rough surfaces

8. According to Danny, what is a crucial skill for robots if they are to do our bidding?

- a) Moving around
- b) Recognizing human faces
- c) Talking and feeling
- d) Making sense of the world

9. What does Prof. Porgio want to do with robots?

- a) to make them simple as machines
- b) to give them much more human ability
- c) to design them like animals
- d) to provide them sports abilities

10. What was not mentioned about the storage of people in their brains according to Prof. Porgio?

- a) Color
- b) Texture
- c) Shapes
- d) Waves

11. Why did Danny listen to eight-note melodies? To .....

- a) decide which melody is nice
- b) reveal how his brain works
- c) check his hearing problem
- d) to relax after working

12. Why did Danny go back to GERAL Edelmann? Because he wanted to.....

- a) ask for the help about designing a new robot
- b) buy the robot that he designed
- c) re-examine the dream to make a robot
- d) give a hand to GERAL Edelmann to make a robot

13. What makes the robot "Darwin" like a biological organism?

- a) its ability to run
- b) its ability to think
- c) its ability to make choices
- d) its ability to sleep

14. According to the quote of Marvin Minsky, which one is not involved in the tasks of the machine with intelligence in the near future?

- a) reading Shakespeare
- b) educating itself
- c) telling a joke
- d) playing football

15. Who was voted as the 26th best living genius in the world?

- a) Prof. Ishiguro
- b) Prof. Brook
- c) Prof. Minsky
- d) Prof. Edelmann

**Part B: Vocabulary**

1. Seeing that her husband was coming, she **hastily** changed the subject.  
a) interminably                      b) permanently                      c) inexorably                      d) promptly
2. Nothing will stop them in their ..... for truth.  
a) quest                                  b) embrace                                  c) quiver                                  d) endure
3. The talks ended **abruptly** when one of the delegates walked out in protest.  
a) unexceptionally                      b) unfoundedly                      c) unexpectedly                      d) unfairly
4. That's **weird**, I thought I'd left my keys on the table but they're not there.  
a) funny                                  b) interesting                                  c) odd                                  d) annoying
5. This glass has been used, please ..... me a clean one.  
a) fend                                  b) feud                                  c) flay                                  d) fetch
6. Her bicycle hit a ..... in the road and threw her off.  
a) clamp                                  b) bump                                  c) clique                                  d) baffle
7. My father asked me to do my mother's ..... after his departure.  
a) braiding                                  b) besiege                                  c) bidding                                  d) binding
8. Take care when you walk on that path, the paving stones are rather .....  
a) unformed                                  b) unbroken                                  c) uncovered                                  d) uneven
9. Jack watches at least two movies a day, in fact he is a movie .....  
a) fanatic                                  b) critic                                  c) fringe                                  d) cripple
10. We thought the concert in the park would be popular but we didn't ..... so many people turning up.  
a) arrive                                  b) anticipate                                  c) reject                                  d) invite
11. She was cooking a meal while ..... holding a business meeting via her mobile phone.  
a) simultaneously                      b) abruptly                                  c) coincidentally                      d) randomly
12. Its successful progression responds ....., ,inherently, to the in situ conditions through which it arises.

a) dramatically                      b) mutually                      c) basically                      d) intrinsically

13. My father had always been ..... sports and had played football in his younger days and then later cricket.

a) uninterested in                      b) undetermined about                      c) keen on                      d) indifferent to

14. Although seen as toys, many are ..... from real weapons unless you hold them and examine their workings.

a) manageable                      b) indistinguishable                      c) dependable                      d) perceptible

15. This drug has been heralded as a major ..... in the fight against breast cancer.

a) breakthrough                      b) decline                      c) stability                      d) decrease

